Maxx E. Phillips 10032 66-250 Kamehameha Hwy, Suite D103 Hale'iwa, HI 96712 Telephone: (808) 388-3825 MaxxEPhillips@gmail.com

David Kimo Frankel 5791 1638-A Mikahala Way Honolulu, HI 96816 davidkimofrankel@hawaiiantel.net

Attorneys for Keep the North Shore Country

## RECEIVED

17 DEC - 7 P1 :15

FIRESTAY A WILLIAM STATE OF HAWAII

### BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Final Habitat Conservation Plan and Incidental Take License for the Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project by Applicant Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC; Tax Map Key Nos. (1) 5-6-008:006 and (1) 5-6-006:018, Koolauloa District, Island of Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi.

Case No. BLNR-CC-17-001

KEEP THE NORTH SHORE COUNTRY'S EXCEPTIONS TO THE HEARING OFFICER'S RECOMMENDED FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND DECISION AND ORDER FILED NOVEMBER 1, 2017; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

HEARING OFFICER: YVONNE Y. IZU

# KEEP THE NORTH SHORE COUNTRY'S EXCEPTIONS TO THE HEARING OFFICER'S RECOMMENDED FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, AND DECISION AND ORDER FILED NOVEMBER 1, 2017

Pursuant to Minute Order No. 12, Keep the North Shore Country submits its exceptions to the Hearing Officer's Recommended Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision and Order filed November 1, 2017. Keep the North Shore Country agrees with the Hearing Officer's determination that Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC's (NPM) habitat conservation plan (HCP) must be disapproved as it fails to meet the requirements of HRS chapter 195D and only points out minor corrections that should be made:

FOF 194 and COL 5.e: This FOF and COL use the word "may" when all the evidence

demonstrates that all the wind farms with HCPs have actually taken more 'ope'ape'a, our

endangered native Hawaiian hoary bats, than predicted. See e.g. FOF 192. Every HCP approved

in this state has underestimated the number of 'ope'ape'a that would be killed by wind turbine

generators. Exhibit A-1 at 56; Exhibit B-12 at 4-20; B-30 at 10; Vol. 1, Tr. 08/07/17 at 40-41

and 84; Exhibit B-5 at 3-78; Exhibit B-12 at 19. FOF 194 and COL 5.e should delete the word

"may."

FOF 239 and COL 20: One phrase in FOF 239 could be misinterpreted to suggest that

NPM's HCP will actually minimize and completely mitigate the take of 'ōpe'ape'a – despite the

clear findings in FOFs 194, 205, 207, 208, 216, 227. The emphasis in this FOF is the funding,

not the effectiveness of the measures. FOF 239 should read:

The funds will be adequate to ensure monitoring of the Covered Species by the State and

to ensure that the Applicant takes all actions necessary that it has proposed to minimize

and mitigate the impacts of the take.

Similar changes should be made to COLs 20 and 23.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, December 7, 2017.

David Kimo Frankel

Maxx E. Phillips

Attorney for Keep the North Shore Country

2

### BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Final Habitat Conservation Plan and Incidental Take License for the Na Pua Makani Wind Energy Project by Applicant Na Pua Makani Power Partners, LLC; Tax Map Key Nos. (1) 5-6-008:006 and (1) 5-6-006:018, Koolauloa District, Island of Oʻahu, Hawaiʻi.

Case No. BLNR-CC-17-001

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of Keep The North Shore Country's exceptions to the Hearings Officer's Recommended Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decision and Order was duly served upon the following parties, by Hand Delivery, U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, or electronically, on December 7, 2017, at the addresses below:

YVONNE Y. IZU, ESQ. Hearing Officer yizu@moriharagroup.com

CINDY Y. YOUNG, ESQ.
Deputy Attorney General
Department of the Attorney General
465 South King Street, Room 300
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813
Counsel for the Board of Land
and Natural Resources
cindy.y.young@hawaii.gov

MS. ELIZABETH J. RAGO 56-331 Kekauoha Street Kahuku, Hawai'i 96731 elizabethrago@gmail.com

NA PUA MAKANI POWER PARTNERS LLC John P. Manaut, Esq. Puananionaona P. Thoene, Esq. jpm@carlsmith.com and pthoene@carlsmith.com

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, December 7, 2017.

DAVID KIMO FRANKEL MAXX E. PHILLIPS

Attorneys for Keep the North Shore Country